

# Exploring the Indicators of Sustainable Tourism Management in Pakistan

Muhammad Kamran<sup>1</sup>, Prof Dr. Juan Antonio duro Moreno<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>PhD scholar in Tourism and leisure, Universitat Rovira i Virgili, Spain

<sup>2</sup>Professor, Universitat Rovira i Virgili, Spain

---

## ABSTRACT

As plenty of natural resources that are abundantly available in Pakistan, the potential for the fruitful implementation of sustainable tourism exists. The nation's natural resources can be used in a sustainable way not exclusively to grow the nation's present tourism profile yet additionally to add to the general achievement of its national objectives. This review paper is an attempt to conceptually explore the indicators of Sustainable Tourism Management which could help in comprehending the role of Pakistan's National Tourism Policy. This is accomplished by exploring its adherence to the standards of sustainability oriented tourism development and assessing its effect on the execution of sustainable tourism. Based on exploration, various indicators have been identified which may help to study the real situation of eco-friendly tourism management, which may be initiated as an approach for economical, social and cultural development and then for sustainability of the tourism management of Pakistan.

**Keywords:** Sustainable Tourism Management, Indicators, Pakistan

---

## INTRODUCTION

The Pakistan Government is as of now using the ideas of sustainability to outline its endeavours at broadening its economic base and accomplishing developed nation status. It is under this pioneer there has been expanded concentration and venture into the improvement of the tourism area. Because of the plenty of natural resources that are abundantly available in Pakistan, the potential for the fruitful implementation of sustainable tourism exists. The nation's natural resources can be used in a sustainable way not exclusively to grow the nation's present tourism profile yet additionally to add to the general achievement of its national objectives.

This is vigorously dependent on the active implementation and follow-up of the national tourism policy as it directly affects the proposed sustainable operation and management of the tourism industry. It is against this view that this review paper is an attempt to conceptually explore the indicators of Sustainable Tourism Management which could help in comprehending the role of Pakistan's National Tourism Policy. This will be accomplished by exploring its adherence to the standards of sustainability oriented tourism development and assessing its effect on the execution of sustainable tourism.

### Sustainability

Sustainability is a policy concept originated as a consequence of Brundtland Report (1987), the term "sustainability" becomes essential as there is a pressure between the aspirations of mankind towards a better existence on the one side and the limitations obligated by natural world on the other part (Kuhlman and Farrington, 2010). Sustainability is correlated to the different means of appraisal about the humankind, and structures of social and personal practice that may lead to, moral, empowered and individually contented individuals, communities built on combined commitment, forbearance and equity; social systems and institutions that are participatory, apparent and just; and ecological practices that signify and prolong bio-diversity and life supporting natural processes. (Hall, 2011).

The idea of sustainability has been made and incorporated in every one of the divisions of people activities, including tourism; and based on standards of supportability, another ideological stage for tourism area has been composed. United Nations reports allude to key sustainability ideas as inter-generational equity, biological sustainability and reasonable dispersion of wealth, community cooperation and access to resources. A hefty number of these can be related with quality of life or prosperity.

## **SUSTAINABLE TOURISM MANAGEMENT**

Negative effects from tourism happen, when the level of visitors utilization of resources is more than the environment's capacity to adapt to this utilization inside the worthy furthest reaches of change. Tourism can cause change or loss of nearby character and qualities, brought by a few firmly related impacts: commodification, institutionalization, loss of legitimacy and staged legitimacy, adjustment to sightseer requests. Since tourism includes development of individuals to various land areas and foundation of social relations between individuals, who might somehow or another not meet, social conflicts can occur because of contrasts in societies, ethnic and religious gatherings, qualities and ways of life, dialects and levels of flourishing. The outcome can be an overexploitation of the cultural and social conveying limit of the local community.

Lately, sustainable development forced itself as a fundamental objective of any human action, paying little respect to its result. Economic development and growth issues are pivotal, especially in activities with continuous development record. As one of those activities, tourism has demonstrated concern for sustainable improvement at all levels. Sustainability in tourism is possible when it confronts with quality and systematic management, which would result in a competitive and sustainable tourism management. It entails a continuing process of change management, which comprises optimal economic development of tourism, a superior level of quality of life, ecological conservation, social and cultural legacy protection and its valorisation with the intention of general as well as economic development of tourist places (Blažević, 2007; Pearce, 2015).

There are incalculable definitions about sustainable tourism flowing far and wide, contingent upon intrigue, position and foundation of the creator and touching the three viewpoints economy, condition or social issues. Sustainable tourism is an umbrella for a wide-range of tourism like nature-based, urban-or even mass tourism, if they take after the regulations of sustainability as portrayed beneath. A sustainable development ought to guarantee a controlled development of tourism by utilizing resources, which are the premise of tourism development, for the present development, yet in the meantime by protecting the resources for encourage generations (UNEP and UNWTO, 2005). As per Agenda 21 (UNWTO, 1992) sustainable development in tourism ought to be founded on sustainable conservation of biological, socio-cultural and economic components, with the nearness of human activities and procedures as a key factor (Črnjar and Črnjar, 2009).

## **SUSTAINABLE TOURISM IN PAKISTAN**

Tourism is an under-appraised industry in Pakistan. The role of government in tourism development has never been a pushing one. In spite of Indian Ocean earth-quake, Tsunami, earth tremor in Pakistan, circumstance in Afghanistan, surges and drafts in different parts of the locale, South Asian execution in tourism division has been on consistent change throughout the previous couple of years be that as it may, insights of 2013 show Pakistan lingering behind in such manner (Bilal, Dr.Muhammad, 2013). Pakistan holds a great deal of tourism attraction. Mountaineering, water bolster, beautiful excellence and archaeological and social locales like, Buddha, Mohinjo Doro, Harapa, Kalash legacy, have incredible attractions for the visitors. In spite of the majority of this potential, and one of the ordinarily perceived sources of gaining, tourism in Chitral and the greater part of different spots and territories isn't being figured out how to its ideal.

Eco-tourism is the travel-to-enjoy to appreciate the world's stunning decent variety of characteristic life and human culture without making harm to both. Worldwide fund for nature Pakistan (WWF-P) is pioneer in presenting sustainable eco-tourism activities in the northern zones of Pakistan. WWF-Pakistan in Northern regions goes for making eco-tourism as sustainable, dependable and condition agreeable (Andrew, 2005). The primary points of eco-tourism are to secure and protect nature and to encourage give the way to do as such (money related and instructive) by straightforwardly supporting local groups. Different perspectives, for example, the sustainability of nearby culture and history additionally shape some portion of this low-affect way to deal with tourism. Christina (2008) proposed that NGO's assume fundamental role in the financial elevate of the mountain community of the Northern territories. IUCN<sup>1</sup> (2009) announced that Northern regions are rich blend of regular and cultural heritage makes the area an especially important tourist destination. Contemporary geopolitical talks infrequently specify tourism, and the tourism survey is once in a while, if at any time, confined inside an unequivocally geopolitical context (Abbas et al., 2015). The government needs to give fundamental facilities to the ordinary citizens and enhance their expectation for everyday comforts, which will lead the preservation of common resources of the territory. The local community be associated with the development activities and promotion of tourism in the territory (Nadeem, 2014).

As per Becken and Patterson (2009), tourism-related activities require vitality specifically as non-renewable energy sources or in a roundabout way as power frequently produced from oil, coal or gas. This utilization prompts the outflow

---

<sup>1</sup> The World Conservation Union (IUCN). IUCN Guidelines for the Prevention of Biodiversity Loss Caused by Alien Invasive Species; Species Survival Commission, Invasive Species Specialist Group, IUCN: Geneva, Switzerland, 2000.

of ozone harming substances, for the most part carbon dioxide. Tourism isn't a customary division in the System of National Accounts and accordingly no nation has far reaching national insights on the vitality request or outflows particularly coming about because of tourism.

Dumitras and Pop (2009) plans to imagine and comprehend tourists attitude towards the administrations, amusement openings and natural perspectives identified with the Rodna Mountain National Park amid winter. As indicated by Khalil, Kakar, and Waliullah (2007), the significant effect of tourism on Pakistan economy legitimizes the need of open intercession pointed, from one viewpoint, at advancing and expanding tourism request and, then again, giving and encouraging the development of tourism supply.

### **INDICATORS OF SUSTAINABLE TOURISM**

Indicators are measures of the presence or seriousness of current issues, signs of up and coming circumstances or issues, measures of hazard and potential requirement for activity, and intends to distinguish and measure the consequences of our activities. Indicators are data sets which are formally chosen to be utilized all the time to quantify changes that are of significance for tourism improvement and management (World Tourism Organization, 2004). They can quantify in terms of adjustments in tourism's own particular structures and interior elements, changes in outer elements which influence tourism and the effects caused by tourism. Both quantitative and subjective data can be utilized for sustainability indicators. An indicator is regularly looked over a scope of conceivable informational indexes or data sources since it is significant with respect to the key issues to which tourism administrators must react. Utilization of that indicator can prompt activities to suspect and anticipate unwanted (or unsustainable) circumstances at goals (World Tourism Organization, 2004).

To estimate whether tourism development at goal level is sustainable or not, and to what degree, there is a need to make an arrangement of indicators that measure advance in accomplishing sustainable improvement. This literature review incorporates an evaluation of how singular indicators ought to be evaluated as far as how they address the issues of stakeholders in tourism and, besides, how indicators can be surrounded inside a larger structure that considers a thorough appraisal of how they add to an all encompassing perspective of the different stages towards sustainable tourism development.

Indicators for sustainable tourism may exist at national, territorial and goal level and they have socio-social, financial and ecological measurement (Ceron, 2003; Gebhard et al., 2007). Each measurement has at least one topics (issues). Additionally there are indicators created from these subjects. Moreover, the review of literature asserts few or various indicators for sustainable tourism development.

Keeping in mind the end goal to maintain a strategic distance from the confusion and tourism's sustainable development information to be practically identical for various vacationer goals and nations, WTO notices various pattern issues and also various benchmark indicators for sustainable tourism of visitor goals. While the displayed list of baseline issues for sustainable tourism is pertinent to each locale and each sort of tourism everywhere throughout the world, the arrangement of indicators having a place with each issue ought to be balanced by the exceptional states of the territory or nation where the sustainability of tourism is assessed.

Significance to the key issues of a goal and common sense of age and utilize are the premier contemplations in distinguishing indicators (World Tourism Organization, 2004). What's more, criteria identifying with logical believability, lucidity, and capacity to be utilized as benchmarks for examination after some time and with different goals are utilized to assist pick the indicators prone to have the best effect on choices or activities. Indicators are considered pertinent just in the event that they successfully address the key issues related with arranging and management of a goal. They should likewise be achievable to gather and investigate and useful to set up.

Indicators are a piece of the primary perceived assessment instruments used to help sustainable tourism policy implementation (Choi and Sirakaya, 2006; Miller, 2001). They constitute an arrangement of data that can serve to assess critical changes over the span of tourism improvement and tourism management. For tourism administrators, the way toward characterizing indicators is a viable methods for pulling in thoughtfulness regarding key inquiries and securing data on the status and states of kinds of capital (i.e. common and human). In this manner, indicators go about as an impetus to help an arranging procedure (Mascarenhas et al., 2010). Finally, when clear targets are as of now set up, indicators can likewise assume a more solid part in the checking and estimating the accomplishment of goals. They can decide if an arrangement or technique meets the goals at first expressed. Moreover, the reality of considering an indicator tends to support exactness, and now and again outlines irregularities in the targets at first set (Bell and Morse, 2008). Therefore, indicators ought to be refreshed occasionally.

The Bellagio Principles – an arrangement of sustainable development standards created by the Rockefeller Foundation in 1996 – manage four essential parts of evaluating progress toward sustainable improvement: identifying clear

objectives for sustainability and down to earth meanings of those terms; consolidating a feeling of a larger framework with particular, little scale issues; appraisal of procedures; and checking (Hardi, 1997).

A gauge is viewed as a device which gathers every one of the indicators and measures the general sustainability score. The gauge can be utilized to quantify human sustainability, biological system sustainability, tourism part's sustainability or a general public's sustainability (IUCN, 2000). A mix of every one of these components can likewise be estimated through the gauge. As per Asnarulkhadi (2003), an indicator is a sign, file or flag that pictures a situation or framework. The inadequate literature on sustainable tourism indicators prompts adjustment of the indicators from different ways to deal with sustainable tourism development close by community improvement indicators. All the indicators proposed by the formative associations depend on the fundamental financial, socio-cultural and environmental pillars recommended in the Brundt and Commission, 1987.

The indicators arising from the review were identified which sought after to scrutinize the sustainable tourism development practices in Pakistan. They are

- (a) Employment in the tourism industry,
- (b) Expenditures attributed to the tourism industry
- (c) Air and water quality
- (d) Tourism service
- (e) Hotel issues

## CONCLUSION

This review on exploring indicators of sustainable tourism management has both practical and theoretical contributions to offer sustainability through tourism development activities in Pakistan with the aid of appropriate policy instruments. The scope of this review extends to entire tourism locations in Pakistan, where all of them are natural destinations. The indicators identified here may help to study further the real situation of eco-friendly tourism management, which may be initiated as an approach for economical, social and cultural development and then for sustainability of the tourism management of Pakistan. Also, the exploration of the indicators pertaining to sustainability in tourism practices may help in identifying the determinants and influencing factors that contribute to the sustainable tourism management in Pakistan.

## REFERENCES

- [1]. Abbas, Syed Naeem, Sardar, Mujeeb, Muhammad, Mamoonah Wali, Abbas, Yawar, Karim, Rizwan, Ali, Nawazish, Abbas, Saeed, Haider, Syed Ali. (2015). Ecotourism Potential in Gilgit-Baltistan (A Case Study of Khunjerab National Park). *American Journal of Agriculture and Forestry*. ISSN: 2330-8591. 2015; 3(6): 253-259
- [2]. Asnarulkhadi, A.S. Pengenalan Pembangunan Komuniti. *Serdang*; Selaseh Press: Serdang, Malaysia, 2003.
- [3]. Becken, S. and M. Patterson, 2009. Measuring National Carbon Dioxide Emissions from Tourism as a Key Step towards Achieving Sustainable Tourism. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 14(4): 323-338.
- [4]. Bilal, Dr. Muhammad. (2013) Doctoral thesis: The Role of Tourism in the Economic Development of Pakistan"5 a case study of Northern Areas, Department of Economics, *University of Peshawar*.
- [5]. Blažević, B. & Peršić, M. (Eds.) (2009). Turistička regionalizacija u globalnim procesima, Opatija: Fakultet za turistički i hotelski menadžment Opatija, *Sveučilište u Rijeci*.
- [6]. Ceron, J-P., "Tourism and Sustainable Development Indicators: The Gap between Theoretical Demands and Practical Achievements", *Current Issues in Tourism*, 6(1), 2003;
- [7]. Choi, H.C. and I. Murray, 2010. Resident attitudes toward sustainable community tourism. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 18(4): 575-594.
- [8]. Črnjar, M. & Črnjar, K. (2009). *Menadžment održivog razvoja*. Opatija: Fakultet za turistički i hotelski menadžment Opatija, Sveučilište u Rijeci.
- [9]. Dumitras, D.E. and E. Pop, 2009. Perspective on the Management of Rodna Mountains National Park, *Bulletin UASVM Horticulture*, 66(2): 164-169.
- [10]. Gebhard, K., Meyer, M., and Roth, S., "Criteria for Sustainable Tourism for the three Biosphere Reserves Aggtelek, Babia Gora and Sumava", *Ecological Tourism in Europe (ETE)*
- [11]. Hall, C. M. (2011). Policy learning and policy failure in sustainable tourism governance: from first-and second-order to third-order change? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19 (4-5), 649-671.
- [12]. Hardi, P. Measurement and indicators program of the International Institute for Sustainable Development. *Sustainability Indicators: Report of the Project on Indicators of Sustainable Development: SCOPE Report No. 58*, eds. Moldan, B. and Billharz, B. John Wiley: Chichester, pp. 28 – 32, 1997.
- [13]. Khalil, Samina, Kakar, Mehmood Khan, and Waliullah (2007). Role of Tourism in Economic Growth: Empirical Evidence from Pakistan Economy. *The Pakistan Development Review* 46 : 4 Part II (Winter 2007) pp. 985–995
- [14]. Kuhlman, Tom and Farrington, John, (2010) What is Sustainability? *Sustainability* 2010, 2,3436-3448; doi:10.3390/su2113436
- [15]. Mascarenhas, A., Coelho, P., Subtil, E., and Ramos T.B. (2010). "The Role of Common Local Indicators in Regional Sustainability Assessment". *Ecological Indicators*, 10: 646-656.

- [16]. Miller, G. (2001). "The development of indicators for sustainable tourism: Results of a Delphi survey of tourism researchers". *Tourism Management*, 22: 351–362.
- [17]. Nadeem I. 2013. Suggestion/Recommendation for Tourism Promotion in Northern Areas of Pakistan. *Tourism Report*, p.16.
- [18]. Pearce, D. G. (2015). Destination management in New Zealand: Structures and functions. *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management*, 4 (1), 1-12.
- [19]. UNEP & UNWTO, United Nations Environmental Programme and the World Tourism Organization (2005). *Making tourism more sustainable: A Guide for Policy Makers*. Paris: United Nations Environmental Programme.
- [20]. UNWTO, World Tourism Organization (1992). *Agenda 21*. United Nations Conference on Environment & Development, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, [http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/ Agenda21.pdf](http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/Agenda21.pdf)
- [21]. UNWTO, World Tourism Organization (2011). *Policy and practice for global tourism*. Madrid: UNWTO.
- [22]. World Tourism Organization (2004). *Indicators of Sustainable Development for Tourism Destinations A Guidebook World Tourism Organization* - ISBN 92- 844-0726-5 Calle Capitán Haya, 42 28020 Madrid, Spain